Stage 3 proposal: Feature #21

Resolve inconsistent class values for `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<searchtitle>`

Champion

Eliot Kimber, Individual Member

Tracking information

Event	Date	Links
Stage 1 proposal accepted	9 May 2017	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201705/msg00022.html
Stage 2 proposal submitted	4 May 2019	PDF DITA
Stage 2 proposal discussed	7 May 2019	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201905/msg00038.html
Stage 2 proposal approved	14 May 2019	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201905/msg00043.html
Stage 3 proposal submitted to reviewers	10 Oct 2019	Deb Bissantz, Vasont Systems Zoe Lawson, Casenet, LLC
Stage 3 proposal (this document) submitted to TC	21 Oct 2019; 29 Oct 2019 (contains corrected affiliation for Zoe Lawson)	

Approved technical requirements

The `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<searchtitle>` elements have the same semantics in maps and topics but in DITA 1.x are separately declared (and thus have different base class values) for maps and topics. These elements should have the same base type in both maps and topics.

Dependencies or interrelated proposals

No related or dependent proposals identified.

Modified grammar files

- `mapMod.rng` (remove declarations for `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>`):

```
    <define name="anchor">
      <ref name="anchor.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="linktext">
      <ref name="linktext.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="navref">
      <ref name="navref.element"/>
    </define>
  ...
    <define name="reltable">
      <ref name="reltable.element"/>
```

```
    </define>
    <define name="searchtitle">
       <ref name="searchtitle.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="shortdesc">
       <ref name="shortdesc.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="topicmeta">
      <ref name="topicmeta.element"/>
    </define>

...

    <div>
        <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Short Description</a:documentation>
        <define name="shortdesc.content">
          <zeroOrMore>
            <choice>
              <ref name="title.cnt"/>
              <ref name="xref" dita:since="1.3"/>
            </choice>
          </zeroOrMore>
        </define>
        <define name="shortdesc.attributes">
          <ref name="univ-atts"/>
          <optional>
            <attribute name="outputclass"/>
          </optional>
        </define>
        <define name="shortdesc.element">
          <element name="shortdesc" dita:longName="Short Description">
            <a:documentation>The short description (&lt;shortdesc>) element occurs
between the topic title and the topic body, as the initial paragraph-like content of a
topic, or it can be embedded
            in an abstract element. The short description, which represents the
purpose or theme of the topic, is also intended to be used as a link preview and for
searching. When used within a
            DITA map, the short description of the &lt;topicref> can be used to
override the short description in the topic. Category: Topic elements</a:documentation>
            <ref name="shortdesc.attlist"/>
            <ref name="shortdesc.content"/>
          </element>
        </define>
        <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
          <ref name="shortdesc.attributes"/>
        </define>

    </div>
    <div>
        <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Link Text</a:documentation>
        <define name="linktext.content">
          <zeroOrMore>
            <choice>
              <ref name="words.cnt"/>
              <ref name="ph"/>
            </choice>
          </zeroOrMore>
        </define>
        <define name="linktext.attributes">
          <optional>
            <attribute name="outputclass"/>
          </optional>
          <ref name="univ-atts"/>
        </define>
        <define name="linktext.element">
          <a:documentation>The &lt;linktext> element provides the literal label or line
of text for a link. In most cases, the text of a link can be resolved during
processing by cross reference with
          the target resource. Use the &lt;linktext> element only when the target
cannot be reached, such as when it is a peer or external link, or the target is local
but not in DITA format. When
          used inside a topic, it will be used as the text for the specified link;
when used within a map, it will be used as the text for generated links that point to
the specified topic. Category:
```

```
          Related Links elements</a:documentation>
        <element name="linktext" dita:longName="Link Text">
          <ref name="linktext.attlist"/>
          <ref name="linktext.content"/>
        </element>
      </define>
      <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="linktext.attributes"/>
      </define>

    </div>
    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Search Title</a:documentation>
      <define name="searchtitle.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <ref name="words.cnt"/>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attributes">
        <optional>
          <attribute name="outputclass"/>
        </optional>
        <ref name="univ-atts"/>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.element">
        <a:documentation>When your DITA topic is transformed to XHTML, the
&lt;searchtitle> element is used to create a title element at the top of the resulting
HTML file. This title is normally used
          in search result summaries by some search engines, such as that in Eclipse
(http://eclipse.org); if not set, the XHTML's title element defaults to the source
topic's title content (which may
          not be as well optimized for search summaries). Category: Topic elements</
a:documentation>
        <element name="searchtitle" dita:longName="Search Title">
          <ref name="searchtitle.attlist"/>
          <ref name="searchtitle.content"/>
        </element>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="searchtitle.attributes"/>
      </define>
    </div>

...

    <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- map/linktext "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- map/searchtitle "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- map/shortdesc "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
```

- Move declarations for `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` from `topicMod.rng` to `commonElementsMod.rng`. Add `@outputclass` used in map version of `<linktext>` to `<linktext>` attributes (was missing from topic version in DITA 1.3).

  `topicMod.rng`

```
<define name="linkpool">
    <ref name="linkpool.element"/>
```

```
      </define>
      <define name="linktext">
        <ref name="linktext.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="prolog">
        <ref name="prolog.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="related-links">
        <ref name="related-links.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle">
        <ref name="searchtitle.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="section">
        <ref name="section.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="sectiondiv">
        <ref name="sectiondiv.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="shortdesc">
        <ref name="shortdesc.element"/>
      </define>
      <define name="titlealts">
        <ref name="titlealts.element"/>
      </define>

...
    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Search Title</a:documentation>

      <define name="searchtitle.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <choice>
            <ref name="words.cnt"/>
            <ref name="ph"/>
          </choice>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attributes">
        <optional dita:since="DITA 1.3">
          <attribute name="outputclass"/>
        </optional>
        <ref name="univ-atts"/>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.element">
        <element name="searchtitle" dita:longName="Search Title">
          <a:documentation>When your DITA topic is transformed to XHTML, the
&lt;searchtitle> element is used to create a title element at the top of the resulting
HTML file. This title is normally
            used in search result summaries by some search engines, such as that in
Eclipse (http://eclipse.org); if not set, the XHTML's title element defaults to the
source topic's title content
            (which may not be as well optimized for search summaries) Category: Topic
elements</a:documentation>
          <ref name="searchtitle.attlist"/>
          <ref name="searchtitle.content"/>
        </element>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="searchtitle.attributes"/>
      </define>

    </div>
    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Short Description</a:documentation>
      <define name="shortdesc.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <choice>
            <ref name="title.cnt"/>
            <ref name="xref" dita:since="1.3"/>
          </choice>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="shortdesc.attributes">
```

```
                <ref name="univ-atts"/>
                <optional>
                    <attribute name="outputclass"/>
                </optional>
            </define>
            <define name="shortdesc.element">
                <element name="shortdesc" dita:longName="Short Description">
                    <a:documentation>The short description (&lt;shortdesc&gt;) element occurs
between the topic title and the topic body, as the initial paragraph-like content of a
topic, or it can be embedded
                        in an abstract element. The short description, which represents the
purpose or theme of the topic, is also intended to be used as a link preview and for
searching. When used within a
                        DITA map, the short description of the &lt;topicref&gt; can be used to
override the short description in the topic. Category: Topic elements</a:documentation>
                    <ref name="shortdesc.attlist"/>
                    <ref name="shortdesc.content"/>
                </element>
            </define>
            <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
                <ref name="shortdesc.attributes"/>
            </define>

        </div>

...

    <div>
        <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Link Text</a:documentation>

        <define name="linktext.content">
            <zeroOrMore>
                <choice>
                    <ref name="words.cnt"/>
                    <ref name="ph"/>
                </choice>
            </zeroOrMore>
        </define>
        <define name="linktext.attributes">
            <ref name="univ-atts"/>
        </define>
        <define name="linktext.element">
            <element name="linktext" dita:longName="linktext">
                <a:documentation>The &lt;linktext&gt; element provides the literal label or
line of text for a link. In most cases, the text of a link can be resolved during
processing by cross reference
                    with the target resource. Use the &lt;linktext&gt; element only when the
target cannot be reached, such as when it is a peer or external link, or the target is
local but not in DITA format.
                    When used inside a topic, it will be used as the text for the specified
link; when used within a map, it will be used as the text for generated links that
point to the specified topic.
                    Category: Related Links elements</a:documentation>
                <ref name="linktext.attlist"/>
                <ref name="linktext.content"/>
            </element>
        </define>
        <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
            <ref name="linktext.attributes"/>
        </define>

    </div>

...

    <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="global-atts"/>
        <optional>
            <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/linktext "/>
        </optional>
    </define>

...
```

```
  <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
    <ref name="global-atts"/>
    <optional>
      <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/searchtitle "/>
    </optional>
  </define>


...

  <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
    <ref name="global-atts"/>
    <optional>
      <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/shortdesc "/>
    </optional>
  </define>
```

`commonElementsMod.rng` (insertions highlighted in **bold**):

```
...
    <define name="lines">
      <ref name="lines.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="linktext">
      <ref name="linktext.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="longdescref">
      <ref name="longdescref.element"/>
    </define>
...

    <define name="required-cleanup">
      <ref name="required-cleanup.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="searchtitle">
      <ref name="searchtitle.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="sl">
      <ref name="sl.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="sli">
      <ref name="sli.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="simpletable">
      <ref name="simpletable.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="shortdesc">
      <ref name="shortdesc.element"/>
    </define>
    <define name="state">
      <ref name="state.element"/>
    </define>

...

    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Link Text</a:documentation>

      <define name="linktext.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <choice>
            <ref name="words.cnt"/>
            <ref name="ph"/>
          </choice>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="linktext.attributes">
        <optional>
          <attribute name="outputclass"/>
        </optional>
        <ref name="univ-atts"/>
      </define>
```

```
      <define name="linktext.element">
        <element name="linktext" dita:longName="linktext">
          <a:documentation>The &lt;linktext> element provides the literal label or
line of text for a link. In most cases, the text of a link can be resolved during
processing by cross reference
            with the target resource. Use the &lt;linktext> element only when the
target cannot be reached, such as when it is a peer or external link, or the target is
local but not in DITA format.
            When used inside a topic, it will be used as the text for the specified
link; when used within a map, it will be used as the text for generated links that
point to the specified topic.
            Category: Related Links elements</a:documentation>
          <ref name="linktext.attlist"/>
          <ref name="linktext.content"/>
        </element>
      </define>
      <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="linktext.attributes"/>
      </define>
    </div>

...

    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Search Title</a:documentation>

      <define name="searchtitle.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <choice>
            <ref name="words.cnt"/>
            <ref name="ph"/>
          </choice>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attributes">
        <optional dita:since="DITA 1.3">
          <attribute name="outputclass"/>
        </optional>
        <ref name="univ-atts"/>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.element">
        <element name="searchtitle" dita:longName="Search Title">
          <a:documentation>When your DITA topic is transformed to XHTML, the
&lt;searchtitle> element is used to create a title element at the top of the resulting
HTML file. This title is normally
            used in search result summaries by some search engines, such as that in
Eclipse (http://eclipse.org); if not set, the XHTML's title element defaults to the
source topic's title content
            (which may not be as well optimized for search summaries) Category:
Topic elements</a:documentation>
          <ref name="searchtitle.attlist"/>
          <ref name="searchtitle.content"/>
        </element>
      </define>
      <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
        <ref name="searchtitle.attributes"/>
      </define>
    </div>
    <div>
      <a:documentation>LONG NAME: Short Description</a:documentation>
      <define name="shortdesc.content">
        <zeroOrMore>
          <choice>
            <ref name="title.cnt"/>
            <ref name="xref" dita:since="1.3"/>
          </choice>
        </zeroOrMore>
      </define>
      <define name="shortdesc.attributes">
        <ref name="univ-atts"/>
        <optional>
          <attribute name="outputclass"/>
        </optional>
      </define>
```

```
          <define name="shortdesc.element">
            <element name="shortdesc" dita:longName="Short Description">
              <a:documentation>The short description (&lt;shortdesc&gt;) element occurs
between the topic title and the topic body, as the initial paragraph-like content of a
topic, or it can be embedded
                in an abstract element. The short description, which represents the
purpose or theme of the topic, is also intended to be used as a link preview and for
searching. When used within a
                DITA map, the short description of the &lt;topicref&gt; can be used to
override the short description in the topic. Category: Topic elements</a:documentation>
              <ref name="shortdesc.attlist"/>
              <ref name="shortdesc.content"/>
            </element>
          </define>
          <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
            <ref name="shortdesc.attributes"/>
          </define>
        </div>


...

    <define name="li.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/li "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="linktext.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/linktext "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="lines.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/lines "/>
      </optional>
    </define>

...

    <define name="required-cleanup.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/required-cleanup "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="searchtitle.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/searchtitle "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="shortdesc.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/shortdesc "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
    <define name="simpletable.attlist" combine="interleave">
      <ref name="global-atts"/>
      <optional>
        <attribute name="class" a:defaultValue="- topic/simpletable "/>
      </optional>
    </define>
```

Modified terminology

No change to terminology.

Modified specification documentation

No change to specification documentation other than generated references to the map versions of the `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` elements.

Migration plans for backwards incompatibilities

Documents that do not include literal `@class` values for the map versions of `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` will not be affected.

Documents that include literal `@class` values for the map version of `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` will need to change " `map/`" to " `topic/`" in `@class` values for those elements.

Processors that expect the map versions of the `@class` values for `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` and do not already also expect the topic versions must be updated to expect the topic versions.

Specializations of the map versions of `<shortdesc>`, `<linktext>`, and `<linktitle>` must be updated to change " map/" to " topic/" in the `@class` values for those specializations.