From: Shane Durham, LexisNexis *File & Serve*
To: LegalXML Electronic Court Filing Subcommittee
Regarding: Issue and Proposed Resolution Regarding MDE Policy
Date: November 10, 2006

Intro

During the last face-to-face meeting , I briefly mentioned (by conference call) some implementation issues I encountered with code-sets in the Policy schema for MDEs. The issues I encountered with MDE Policy are but one of several regarding ECF which I have described in a recent OASIS posting:

> http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/legalxml-courtfiling/document.php?document_id=20855
>
> http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/legalxml-courtfiling/document.php?document_id=20856

John Greacen asked that I provide further description of the MDE code-set issues and that I offer a proposed resolution.

The Issue

MDE Policy is unable to express that some codes are conditionally valid, depending on the context.

While code 'X' might be a valid code for a given MDE, it is not necessarily a valid code for *all* of the MDE's messages types, or in all functional contexts. Some codes might be valid when used in conjunction with others, some codes might only be valid under certain functional conditions.

Here are some practical examples with respect to a FilingReview MDE:

- There may exist a set of party type codes which are valid only for case type 'Probate', and another set of party type codes which are valid only for case type 'Domestic Relations'

- There may exist filing type codes which are valid for new-case filings and filing type codes which are valid only for existing-case filings.

Here is a more generalized way we might describe the problem scenarios:

- **A given code's validity might be based on the presence of one or more codes of *another* kind.**

  For example: Party type might be restricted by case type - party type 'plaintiff', might only be valid when the case type is 'civil'.

- **A given code's validity might be based on the presence of one or more codes of the *same* kind.**

  For example: Party type might be restricted by the presence of other party types. – a party type of 'Plaintiff', might only be valid when the filing also contains party type of 'defendant'.

- **A given code's validity might be based on other qualities of the message, or functional context.**

  For example: Filing type might be restricted depending on whether the filing is to a new case, or an existing case, or court might restrict the use of a certain filing type depending on which user is conducting the transaction.

Proposed Changes

I believe we can add some simple and flexible syntactic constructs to the policy message that will allow an implementation to express its code-set hierarchies and context restrictions.

Proposed changes to the policy schema:

- **Enhance the schema so that we may express nested lists of codes.**

  This will enable policy to express code-set hierarchies.

  For example, we can then logically express:

Case Type = 'Civil - Probate'	Case Type = 'Civil - General'
Party Type = A	Party Type = X
Party Type = B	Party Type = Y
Party Type = C	Party Type = Z
Filing Type = 1	Filing Type = 3
Filing Type = 2	Filing Type = 4
Filing Type = 3	Filing Type = 5
Filing Type = 4	

  The above example indicates:

  - When the CaseType = 'Civil - Probate', the valid PartyTypes are A,B, or C.
  - When the CaseType is 'Civil - General', the valid PartyTypes are X,Y,Z.
  - FilingTypes 3 and 4 are valid for both 'Civil – General' and ' 'Civil – Probate'
  - FilingTypes 1 and 2 are only valid for 'Civil - Probate'
  - FilingType 5 is only valid for 'Civil - General'

- **Enhance the schema so that each code might express zero or more implementation-specific ContextRestrictions (as simple name/value pairs).**

  This will enable an implementation's policy to flexibly express restrictions for when a particular code may or may not be used.

  For example, we can then logically express:

  Case Type = 'Civil - Probate'
  Party Type = A
  ContextRestriction:
  When new-case filing, Party Type = B must also be present
  Party Type = B
  ContextRestriction:
  When new-case filing, Party Type = A must also be present
  Party Type = C

  Filing Type = 1
  ContextRestriction: Cannot be used for existing-case filings.
  Filing Type = 2
  ContextRestriction: Cannot be used for new-case filings.
  Filing Type = 3
  Filing Type = 4
  ContextRestriction: For court-use only
  ContextRestriction: Cannot be used for new-case filings.

  The above example indicates:

  - PartyType C may be used in any 'Civil – Probate' filing.
  - During a new-case filing for 'Civil - Probate', if PartyType A is present, so must PartyType B, and vice-versa.
  - During a new-case filing for 'Civil - Probate', only FilingType 1 or 3 may be used.
  - During an existing-case filing for 'Civil - Probate', only FilingType 2 or 3 may be used. FilingType 4 may also be used but only if the user is recognized as a 'court user' (such info may not be known to the FilingAssembly MDE, and, if so, then, it can just assume the FilingType is not available for use at all).

I have attached an XML fragment that illustrates a proposed syntax to express the examples from above. I have also included a graphical representation of that XML (generated with XML-Spy).

XML Example


```
<CoreCodelist>
   <ElementName>case:CaseClassification</ElementName>

   <AllowedCodeValue>
      <ValueText>Civil - Probate</ValueText>
      <CoreCodelist>
         <ElementName>case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode</ElementName>

         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>A</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>PartyType A</DisplayText>
            <ContextRestrictions>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>PeerPartyTypesWhenNewCaseFiling</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>B</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
            </ContextRestrictions>
         </AllowedCodeValue>

         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>B</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>PartyType B</DisplayText>
            <ContextRestrictions>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>PeerPartyTypesWhenNewCaseFiling</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>A</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
            </ContextRestrictions>
         </AllowedCodeValue>

         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>C</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>PartyType C</DisplayText>
         </AllowedCodeValue>
      </CoreCodelist>

      <CoreCodelist>
         <ElementName>jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText</ElementName>

         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>1</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>FilingType 1</DisplayText>
            <ContextRestrictions>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>False</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
            </ContextRestrictions>
         </AllowedCodeValue>
```

```
      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>2</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>FilingType 2</DisplayText>
         <ContextRestrictions>
            <ContextRestriction>
               <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
               <RestrictionValue>False</RestrictionValue>
            </ContextRestriction>
            <ContextRestriction>
               <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
               <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
            </ContextRestriction>
         </ContextRestrictions>
      </AllowedCodeValue>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>3</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>FilingType 3</DisplayText>
      </AllowedCodeValue>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>4</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>FilingType 4</DisplayText>
         <ContextRestrictions>
            <ContextRestriction>
               <RestrictionName>ForCourtUseOnly</RestrictionName>
               <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
            </ContextRestriction>
            <ContextRestriction>
               <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
               <RestrictionValue>False</RestrictionValue>
            </ContextRestriction>
            <ContextRestriction>
               <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
               <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
            </ContextRestriction>
         </ContextRestrictions>
      </AllowedCodeValue>
   </CoreCodelist>
</AllowedCodeValue>

<AllowedCodeValue>
   <ValueText>Civil - General</ValueText>

   <CoreCodelist>
      <ElementName>case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode</ElementName>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>X</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>PartyType X</DisplayText>
      </AllowedCodeValue>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>Y</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>PartyType Y</DisplayText>
      </AllowedCodeValue>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>Z</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>PartyType Z</DisplayText>
      </AllowedCodeValue>
   </CoreCodelist>

   <CoreCodelist>
      <ElementName>jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText</ElementName>

      <AllowedCodeValue>
         <ValueText>3</ValueText>
         <DisplayText>FilingType 3</DisplayText>
      </AllowedCodeValue>
```

```
         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>4</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>FilingType 4</DisplayText>
            <ContextRestrictions>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>ForCourtUseOnly</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>False</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
               <ContextRestriction>
                  <RestrictionName>CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFilings</RestrictionName>
                  <RestrictionValue>True</RestrictionValue>
               </ContextRestriction>
            </ContextRestrictions>
         </AllowedCodeValue>

         <AllowedCodeValue>
            <ValueText>5</ValueText>
            <DisplayText>FilingType 5</DisplayText>
         </AllowedCodeValue>
      </CoreCodelist>
   </AllowedCodeValue>
</CoreCodelist>
```

- **CoreCodelist**
  - **ElementName**: case:CaseClassification
  - **AllowedCodeValue** (2)

	ValueText	CoreCodelist
1	Civil - Probate	CoreCodelist (2)
2	Civil - General	CoreCodelist (2)

1 Civil - Probate — CoreCodelist (2)

	ElementName	AllowedCodeValue
1	case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode	AllowedCodeValue (3)
2	jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText	AllowedCodeValue (4)

1 case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode — AllowedCodeValue (3)

	ValueText	DisplayText	ContextRestrictions
1	A	PartyType A	ContextRestrictions
2	B	PartyType B	ContextRestrictions
3	C	PartyType C	

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction):

RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
PeerPartyTypesWhenNewCaseFiling	B

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction):

RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
PeerPartyTypesWhenNewCaseFiling	A

2 jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText — AllowedCodeValue (4)

	ValueText	DisplayText	ContextRestrictions
1	1	FilingType 1	ContextRestrictions
2	2	FilingType 2	ContextRestrictions
3	3	FilingType 3	
4	4	FilingType 4	ContextRestrictions

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction (2)):

	RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
1	CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings	True
2	CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFili...	False

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction (2)):

	RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
1	CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings	False
2	CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFili...	True

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction (3)):

	RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
1	ForCourtUseOnly	True
2	CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings	False
3	CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFili...	True

2 Civil - General — CoreCodelist (2)

	ElementName	AllowedCodeValue
1	case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode	AllowedCodeValue (3)
2	jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText	AllowedCodeValue (3)

1 case:CasePersonRoleTypeCode — AllowedCodeValue (3)

	ValueText	DisplayText
1	X	PartyType X
2	Y	PartyType Y
3	Z	PartyType Z

2 jxdm:RegisterActionDescriptionText — AllowedCodeValue (3)

	ValueText	DisplayText	ContextRestrictions
1	3	FilingType 3	
2	4	FilingType 4	ContextRestrictions
3	5	FilingType 5	

ContextRestrictions (1 ContextRestriction (3)):

	RestrictionName	RestrictionValue
1	ForCourtUseOnly	True
2	CanSubmitWithNewCaseFilings	False
3	CanSubmitWithExistingCaseFili...	True