OASIS SSTC Open Issues Status

draft-sstc-saml-issues-status-03

February 18, 2002

Hal Lockhart

Introduction

This document reports the current status of open issues as of the date published. Specifically it reflects these documents:

draft-sstc-core-27.pdf

draft-sstc-bindings-model-11.doc

draft-sstc-conform-spec-11-change.doc

In addition, discussions on the mailing list up to the date of this document were also considered.

The color code used is as follows.

- Items marked in <mark style="background-color:green">green</mark> are recommended to be closed permanently.
- Items marked in <mark style="background-color:yellow">yellow</mark> are recommended to be closed with a resolution of deferred.
- Items marked in <mark style="background-color:red">red</mark> need resolution before they can be closed.

Use Case Issues

Group 0: Document Format & Strategy

{All closed or deferred}

Group 1: Single Sign-on Push and Pull Variations

{All closed or deferred}

Group 2: B2B Scenario Variations

{All closed or deferred}

Group 3: Sessions

{All closed or deferred}

Group 4: Security Services

{All closed or deferred}

Group 5: AuthN Protocols

{All closed or deferred}

Group 6: Protocol Bindings

{All closed or deferred}

Group 7: Enveloping vs. Enveloped

{All closed or deferred}

Group 8: Intermediaries

{All closed or deferred}

Group 9: Privacy

ISSUE:[UC-9-02:PrivacyStatement]

SAML 1.0 appears to have taken the position that user control on the disclosure of personal attributes is outside of its scope. Recommend this be closed with a resolution to add none of these requirements.

Group 10: Framework

{All closed or deferred}

Group 11: AuthZ Use Case

{All closed or deferred}

Group 12: Encryption

{All closed or deferred}

Group 13: Business Requirements

{All closed or deferred}

Group 14: Domain Model

{All closed or deferred}

Design Issues

Group 1: Naming Subjects

ISSUE:[DS-1-08: HolderofKey]

Current core says that when Holder of Key is used, the subject is the party that can demonstrate possession of the corresponding private key. Recommend this be closed, however see DS-1-10.

Champion: Irving Reid

ISSUE:[DS-1-09: SenderVouches]

Although the SOAP Profile as a whole has been deferred, the descriptions previously added to core and bindings seem to have satisfied this concern. Recommend this be closed.

Champion: Prateek Mishra

ISSUE:[DS-1-10: SubjectConfirmation Descriptions]

The points raised have not been addressed.

Champion: Hal Lockhart

Group 2: Naming Objects

{All closed or deferred}

Group 3: Assertion Validity

ISSUE:[DS-3-03: ValidityDependsUpon]

Current core does not include this element. Recommend closing it.

Group 4: Assertion Style

ISSUE:[DS-4-08: anyAtttribute]

This proposal has not been accepted. Recommend this be closed.

Champion: Eve Maler

ISSUE:[DS-4-10: URI Fragments]

The use of URI fragments has been added to core in all of the appropriate places Recommend closing it.

Champion: Phill Hallam-Baker

ISSUE:[DS-4-11: Zero Statements]

Core currently specifies that at least one statement must be present. (minOccurs defaults to 1.) Very few people seem to be in favor of allowing zero statements in an assertion. Recommend this be closed.

Champion: Polar Humenn

ISSUE:[DS-4-12: URNs for Protocol Elements]

The sense of the TC is to accept this recommendation, however the actual URN cannot be settled until after the specification has been submitted to OASIS.

Champion: RL "Bob" Morgan

ISSUE:[DS-4-13: Empty Strings]

This issue is not addressed in the current core.

Champion: Eve Maler

Group 5: Reference Other Assertions

ISSUE:[DS-5-04: Request Reference]

AssertionSpecifier has been dropped from Subject. Recommend closing it.

Group 6: Attributes

ISSUE:[DS-6-06: Multivalue Atributes]

saml:AttributeValue now has maxOccurs="unbounded". Recommend closing it.

Champion: Scott Cantor

Group 7: Authentication Assertions

{All closed or deferred}

Group 8: Authorities and Domains

{All closed or deferred}

Group 9: Request Handling

ISSUE:[DS-9-05: RequestAttributes]

Current core does not include this element. Recommend this be deferred.

Champion: Simon Godik

ISSUE:[DS-9-06: Locate AttributeAuthorities]

This feature has been added. Recommend closing it.

Champion: Simon Godik

ISSUE:[DS-9-10: IssueInstant in Req&Response]

This feature has been added. Recommend closing it.

Champion: Scott Cantor

ISSUE:[DS-9-11: Resource in Attribute Query]

There is general agreement to add this, but it is not present in current core.

Champion: RL 'Bob' Morgan

ISSUE:[DS-9-12: Respondwith underspecified]

The Respondwith element has now been satisfactorily described. Recommend closing it.

Champion: Prateek Mishra

Group 10: Assertion Binding

{All closed or deferred}

Group 11: Authorization Decision Assertions

{All closed or deferred}

Group 12: Attribute Assertions

ISSUE:[DS-12-06: RequestALLAttrbs]

Current core says "If no attributes are specified, the list of desired attributes is implicit and application-specific."

ISSUE:[DS-12-07: Remove AttributeValueType]

This has been done in current core. Recommend closing it.

Group 13: Dynamic Sessions

{All closed or deferred}

Group 14:General – Multiple Message Types

ISSUE:[DS-14-07: BearerIndication]

This functionality is provided in the Web Browser Post Profile, which specifies the use of a bearer SubjectConfirmationMethod, but this is not present in the core spec. This is unresolved.

ISSUE:[DS-14-11: CompareElements]

The agreed upon wording has been added to core. Recommend closing it.

ISSUE:[DS-14-14: ErrMsg in Multiple Languages]

Recommend this be deferred.

Champion: Eve Maler

ISSUE:[DS-14-15: Version Syncronization]

Currently only version 1.0 is allowed everywhere. Recommend this be deferred.

Champion Rob Philpott

ISSUE:[DS-14-16: Version Positive]

Current core does not contain this feature. Recommend deferring it.

Champion: Eve Maler

Group 15:Elements Expressing Time Instants

ISSUE:[DS-15-01: NotOnOrAfter]

Current core retains existing NotOnOrAfter semantics. Recommend closing it.

Champion: RL "Bob" Morgan

ISSUE:[DS-15-02: Timezones]

Core states that all time values MUST be expressed in UTC. Recommend closing it.

Champion: Phill Hallam-Baker

ISSUE:[DS-15-3: Time Granularity]

Core states that applications SHOULD NOT rely on other applications supporting time resolution finer than milliseconds.

Champion: Phill Hallam-Baker

Miscellaneous Issues

Group 1: Terminology

{All closed or deferred}

Group 2: Administrative

ISSUE:[MS-2-02: Acknowledgements]

The proposed scheme has been agreed to, but in not in the current documents.

Champion: Eve Maler

Group 3: Conformance

{All closed or deferred}

Group 4: XMLDSIG

{All closed or deferred}

Group 5: Bindings

ISSUE:[MS-5-04: Use Response in POST]

This change has been agreed to, but is not in the current binding spec.

Champion: RL "Bob" Morgan