Meeting Date: Wednesday, February 10, 2016
Time: 19:00 UTC
Purpose: Monthly Meeting

**Co-Chair:** Patrick Maroney  
email: Pmaroney@Specere.org
**Co-Chair:** David Eilken  
email: deilken@soltra.com
**Secretary:** Jane Ginn  
email: jg@ctin.us

**Agenda:**

- Nomination of Jane Ginn as Interoperability SC Secretary
- Review Interoperability SC Charter
- Vendor/Community Interoperability Matrix/Wiki
- Process to Capture Interoperability Sub-Committee Skills/SMEs/Interests
- Interop demo or a product showcase at RSA 2017
- Test Data Set Initiative Straw Man
- Identify/Prioritize Near-Term Objectives

**Minutes:**

- Patrick Maroney welcomed the attendees at the beginning of the WebEx call
  - First order of business –
    - Patrick nominated Jane Ginn as Secretary / Trey Darley 2\textsuperscript{nd} the motion
      - Appointment made
    - Patrick Maroney asked everyone to Register their attendance on the OASIS Interoperability Subcommittee page – Not for voting, but rather to see who has an interest
    - Patrick reviewed Agenda items and asked if there were any additions – none made
- Patrick Maroney then asked the participants to complete a SurveyMonkey survey that will be going out to gauge each participants objectives, interests and time availability to work on the Interoperability Subcommittee
  - Patrick made a motion to proceed with an Interests & Objectives Survey
    - Patrick Maroney stated that there is a need to establish Working Groups with leadership for each
    - **ACTION ITEM** – Patrick Maroney Set up a SurveyMonkey for Interests and Objectives
  - Terry McDonald agreed that a survey would be useful and 2\textsuperscript{nd} the motion

https://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/cti-interoperability/
OASIS CTI-TC Interoperability Subcommittee

- Cory Casanave suggested that the Subcommittee should check with OASIS on the issue of compliance testing
- Allan Thompson asked if we are doing functional vs. performance testing and/or testing for tools that can scale
  - He noted that in previous standards bodies he has been affiliated with the testing of vendor product interoperability is typically implemented in a series of steps, with functionality being the first step, and performance the 2nd step, finally, 3rd step – testing for scalability
- David Eilken presented the matrix that will be used to classify participants in the Interoperability program
  - Most basic information is organization, product name, and description
  - Taking a peer-review approach to avoid the legal liability for OASIS
  - Noted that this is a process that has worked well for Soltra
  - Three categories are:
    - Communities
    - Intelligence Providers
    - Security Tools
  - Recognize that after STIX 2.0/CybOX 3.0 & TAXII 2.0 – Will likely change
    - Then need to have a 4th category to show bi-directional flow
  - Any firm can list (OASIS members and non-OASIS members)
  - There will be a flow-chart that shows the process for Registering
    - Interop SC will post to Wiki with information on how to Register as a Supporter
    - **ACTION ITEM:** Interop SC core team - Develop Registration Process
  - From Survey results and other interest expressed we can reach out to specific CTI-TC members for peer review
    - Findings published on Wiki
    - Semi-autonomous review
  - Allan Thompson said that it sounded like there would be “compliance checking”
    - Indicated that it would be difficult to persuade companies to participate if this was the case
  - Patrick Maroney clarified that there will be Interoperability Showcases
  - Allan Thompson wanted to be sure that the results of the testing would be shared with the vendor only – not publically until anything not functional or performing as stated was fixed
    - Stated that philosophically, the goal of the Subcommittee should be to help vendors succeed by providing Interoperability Guidelines
    - Should not seek to embarrass the vendors
    - There should be no negative risk to vendors for participating
  - David Eilken confirmed that the process would ensure that there would be no negative review in public forum
  - Patrick Maroney stated that the sole mission of the Interoperability Subcommittee would be to promote the rapid adoption of STIX/TAXII/CybOX
  - Trey Darley stated that he had never encountered a vendor that didn’t correct any dysfunctionality when pointed out by a reviewer
    - Also stated there should be no public sharing of results until Interoperability proven
  - David Eilken stated that the reviewer would not post any results until complete process, including corrections were finished
  - Allan Thompson stated that if Interoperability is the goal, why publish anything to the Wiki.
    - David Eilken stated that he envisions thousands of consumers of CTI-TC standard-based products – Public information important
  - Jane Ginn posed a question about the Maturity Model (MM) stated in Interoperability Charter
Suggested that process that Allan Thompson outlined be a basis for that MM

**ACTION ITEM** – Further define the basis for the Maturity Model

- Patrick Maroney went to next order of business – Demo booth for RSA 2017 Showcase
  - Asked for formal action to endorse the showcase
  - A question was posed about which version of STIX would be used for Showcase
  - Terry McDonald suggested that STIX 1.2.1 be best, given that 2.0 version will just be available for public comment in mid-Summer 2017
  - Patrick asked if the attendees agreed with the general intent, if so he made a motion to adopt
    - Allan Thompson 2nd motion agreeing with the general intent
  - Patrick asked Jane Harnad to brief participants on the opportunity
    - Jane Harnad noted that they were awaiting further information on the pricing for the booth from OASIS – After Feb. 22
    - She would inform CTI-TC once information available
  - Motion was passed to proceed with RSA 2017 Showcase
    - **ACTION ITEM** – Patrick Maroney & Jane Ginn follow-up with OASIS to establish sign-up procedures for RSA 2017 Showcase

- Patrick Maroney went on to discuss next order of business – KMIP
  - Key Management Interoperability Protocol (KMIP) group within OASIS has best practices on Interoperability testing
  - Patrick Maroney volunteered to liaison with the KMIP to learn their best practices
    - Asked for a formal motion to liaison with KMIP
    - Allan Thompson 2nd motion
  - Trey Darley noted that Terry McDonald and he had developed test data that could be used
    - He also suggested Interoperability Subcommittee should include findings from CybOX statistics
      - Terry McDonald confirmed that this would be a good idea
  - Patrick Maroney stated he would finish his Straw Man proposal and include this into a collaboration framework
    - **ACTION ITEM** – Patrick Maroney develop Straw Man Proposal
    - **ACTION ITEM** – Patrick Maroney reach out to KMIP Subcommittee and make contact

- Patrick Maroney opened floor for general discussion
  - Allan Thompson asked for further clarification on the intention for the Straw Man proposal
  - Patrick Maroney stated that there would be some data sets and TAXII scripts
    - Important to test TAXII gateway
    - Need to have referenceable packages as part of testing
  - David Eilken noted that the datasets would not be prescriptive – just some recommendations
    - Only on the validation side
    - Will check to see if information is parsed correctly
    - Ramrod tool was noted
  - Allan Thompson stated that it would be preferred to have access to Virtual Tools
    - Wants to download a Virtual Lab for testing
  - Patrick Maroney confirmed that the near-term and long-term objectives of the Straw Man tests would have to be developed

- Patrick Maroney asked for group to confirm that monthly meetings at the time that was identified by the SurveyMonkey he had sent out before would be good for all
  - Terry McDonald noted that it was not an ideal time for him
  - Jane Ginn made a motion to adopt this time
    - Allan Thompson 2nd motion
ACT ACTION ITEM – Jane set monthly meetings for 2nd Wednesday of every month at 19:00 UTC on Interoperability Subcommittee Calendar on OASIS portal

- Patrick Maroney asked Jane Ginn to summarize Action Items
  - Patrick Maroney suggested we use Nabble to collaborate
  - Trey Darley jokingly suggested we abandon Robert’s Rules of Order
- Patrick Maroney closed out the meeting